A VANISHED ARCADIA by R. B. CUNNINGHAME GRAHAM

Advance notes by John C. McIntyre 31.01.2021 for the Cunninghame Graham Society webinar 05.02.2021

Three key sources: 1. R. B. Cunninghame Graham: *A Vanished Arcadia* (CenturyHutchinson Limited, London, 1988, based on original of 1901; 294 pages) ;
2. Robert Bolt: *The Mission* (Novel) (Penguin Books, 1986, 283 pages) ;
3. Film *The Mission*, directed by Roland Joffé; script by Robert Bolt; music by Ennio Morricone; actors Robert de Niro, Jeremy Irons, Ray McInally (1986).

****

R. B. Cunninghame Graham: *A Vanished Arcadia* (Century Hutchinson Limited, London, 1988).

SUMMARY CONTENTS : Introduction by Philip Healy pages v to xiii. Maps xiv-xvi.
Preface xvii-xxiv *[by R. B. Cunninghame Graham. Gartmore, March 1900]*

Chapter 1 01-49: Early history – State of the country – Indian races – Characteristics of the different tribes – Dobrizhoffer's book – Various expeditions – Sebastian Cabot – Don Pedro de Mendoza – Alvar Núñez – His expedition and its results – Other leaders and preachers – Founding of the first mission of the Society of Jesus

Chapter II 50-85: Early days of the missions – New settlements founded – Relations of Jesuits with Indians and Spanish colonists – Destruction of missions by the Mamelucos – Father Maceta – Padre Antonio Ruiz de Montoya – His work and influence – Retreat of the Jesuits down the Paraná

Chapter III 86-101: Spain and Portugal in South America – Enmity between Brazilians and Argentines – Expulsion of Jesuits from Paraguay – Struggles with the natives – Father Mendoza killed – Death of Father Montoya

Chapter IV 102-126: Don Bernardino de Cardenas, Bishop of Paraguay – His labours as apostolic missionary – His ambitions and cunning – Pretensions to saintliness – His attempts to acquire supreme power – Quarrels between Cardenas and Don Gregorio, the temporal Governor

Chapter V 127-169: Renewal of the feud between the Bishop and Don Gregorio – Wholesale excommunications in Asuncion – Cardenas in 1644 formulates his celebrated charges against the Jesuits – The Governor, after long negotiations and much display of force, ultimately succeeds in driving out the Bishop – For three years Cardenas is in desperate straits – In 1648 Don Gregorio is suddenly dismissed,, Cardenas elects himself Governor, and for a short time becomes supreme in Asuncion – The Jesuits are forced to leave the town and to flee to Corrientes – A new Governor is appointed in Asuncion – He defeats Cardenas on the field of battle – The latter is deprived of his power and dies soon after as Bishop of la Paz

Chapter VI 170-195: Description of the mission territory and towns founded by the Jesuits – Their endeavours to attract the Indians – Religious feasts and processions – Agricultural and commercial organisations

Chapter VII 196-212: Causes of the Jesuits' unpopularity – Description of the lives and habits of the priests – Testimony in favour of the missions – Their opposition to slavery – Their system of administration

Chapter VIII 213-234: Don José de Antequera – Appoints himself Governor of Asuncion – Unsettled state of affairs in the town – He is commanded to relinquish his illegal power – He refuses, and resorts to arms – After some success he is defeated and condemned to be executed – He is shot on his way to the scaffold – Renewed hatred against the Jesuits – Their labours

among the Indians of the Chaco
Chapter IX 235-258: The Spanish and Portuguese attempt to force new laws on the Indians – The Indians revolt against them – The hopeless struggle goes on for eight years – Ruin of the missions
Chapter X 259-279: Position of the Jesuits in 1761 – Decree for their expulsion sent from Spain – Bucareli sent to suppress the colleges and drive out the Jesuits – They submit without resistance – After two hundred years they are expelled from Paraguay – The country under the new rule - The system of government practically unchanged
Chapter XI 280-288 Conclusion
Index 289-294

REFERENCES IN CHAPTER I pp. 01-49 : As given by RBCG; stress marks often omitted; title or publication details sometimes at second or later mention.
Page 2: Padre Melchior Inshoffer: *Monarquia de los solipsos* (Madrid, 1770) ;
Page 3: Abbate Muratori : *Christianismo Felice nel Paraguay* ;
Page 3: Father Charlevoix : History of Paraguay (Paris, 1756) ;
Page 4: Raynal ; Montesqueu ; Voltaire ;
4: Father Dobrishoffer: *Historia de Abiponibus* (Vienna, 1784) (in German 1784, English 1822);
5: Francisco Javier Brabo: *Coleccion de Documentos relativos a la expulsion de los Jesuitas de la Republica Argentina y Paraguay* (Madrid, 1872) ;
6: Garcilaso de la Vega El Inca: *Commentarios Reales* (Madrid, 1723?) ;
7: D. Pedro Lozano: *Descripcion Chorographica … del Gran Chaco, Gualamba ….* (Printed by Joseph Santos Balbas, Cordoba [Arg?], 1733) [484 quarto pages];
8: Demersay: *Historire du Paraguay et des Établissements del Jésuites* (Paris, 1862) ;
8: Azara: *Apuntamientos para la Historia Natural de los Quadrupedes del Paraguay ;*
9: Dr. Don Gregorio Funes: *Ensayo de la Historia Civil de Paraguay, Buenos Ayres y Tucuman* (Buenos Ayres, 1816) ;
11-12: Bernal Diaz del Castillo: *Historia de la Conquista de (la) Nueva España* (Madrid, 1796; also given as 1795) ;
13: Letter from Philip II [??? = Philip IV] to the Conde de Chinchón, Viceroy of Peru, Madrid, 30.04.1639 ;
13: Fray Gaspar de Carbajal: Description of descent of Amazon by Orellana (no Spanish title, no place of publication, no date) ;
15: Ruy Diaz de Guzman: *'La Argentina'* in *'Coleccion de Angelis'* (Buenos Ayres, 1836) ;
15-16: Hulderico Schmidel: *Historia y Descubrimiento de el Rio de la Plata y Paraguay*, in Andres Gonzalez Barcia: *Historiadores primitivos de las Indias Occidentales* (Madrid, 1769) ;
Las Casas ;
18: Azara: *Apuntamientos para la Historia Natural de los Quadrupedes del Paraguay ;*
18: Sarmiento: *Civilisation et Barbarisme* ;
19: Felix de Azara: Descripcion y Historia del Paraguay ;
20: Dr. Baptista de Almeida: Grammar of Guarani (Rio de Janeiro, 1879) ;
20: Jean de Lery; Histoire d'un Voyage faict en la Terre du Brezil ;
20: Padre Antonio Ruiz de Montoya: *Tesoro de la Lengua Guarani* (Madrid, 1639) ;
20: Diego Diez de la Guerra: *Catecismo de la Lengua Guarani* (Madrid, Año de 1639) Plus his *Bocabulario y Arte de la Lengua Guarani* ;
20: P. Guevara: *Historia del Paraguay* ;
Page 21: Félix de Azara: *Descripcion y Historia del Paraguay* [May be part of another work]

Page 22: Father Montoya: *Conquista Espiritual del Paraguay* ;
Page 23: Pedro de Angelis: *Coleccion de Obras y Documentos* ;
Page 23: Alfred Demersay: *Histoire du Paraguay et des Établissements des Jésuites* (Paris, 1864) ;
23: Barco de la Centenera: *La Argentina*, book I, canto I in Gonzalez Barcia *Historiadores Primitivos de Indias* (Madrid, 1749) ;
23: Angelis: *Serie de los Señores Gobernadores del Paraguay* (lib. ii, p.187) ;
24: Lozano: *Historia del Paraguay* ;
24: Padre Pedro Lozano: *Descripcion chorographica de Terreno Rios, Arboles y Animales…..* (By Joseph Santos Balbas, Cordoba [Argentina??], 1733) [484 quarto pages] ;
25: Charlevoix: *History of Paraguay* ;
25: Father Dobrishoffer: *History of the Abipones* ;
26: Padre Ruiz Montoya: *Conquista Espiritual del Paraguay*
27: Schmidel: *Historia de la Casa del Gran Moxo* ;
27: Barco de la Centenera: *La Argentina*, canto v ;
28: Padre Antonio Ruiz Montoya: *Gramatica* ; *Tesoro* ; and *Vocabulario* ;
28: Padre Sigismundi: on the medicinal plants of Paraguay ;
28: Du Gratz: *République du Paraguay* ;
28: Demersay: *Histoire du Paraguay* ;
28: Alfred Maury: *La Terre et L'Homme Américain* (p. 392) ;
29: Population figures, estimated by D'Orbigny: *L'Homme Américain* ; Humboldt; Viscount of Itabayana ; Veloso de Oliveira.
30: Bernal Diaz: *Historia de la Conquista de Nueva España* , cap.xxxiv, p. 141 (Madrid, 1795)
32: Washbourne: *History of Paraguay* (p. 32, cap. i, vol. i) ;
32-33: Ruiz [page 15 = Ruy] Diaz de Guzman: *La Argentina* ;
33-34: Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca: *Comentarios de Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca* in Andres Gonzalez Barcia: *Early Historians of the Indies* (Madrid, 1749) ;
40: Félix de Azara: *Historia del Paraguay* ;
42: Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca: *Comentarios de Alvar Nuñez Cabeza de Vaca* in Andres Gonzalez Barcia: *Historiadores Primitivos de las Indias Occidentales* ;
42: Letter from people of the Mission of San Luis to the Governor of Buenos Ayres (1768) ;
45: Guevara: *Historia del Paraguay* in *La Coleccion de Angelis* (Buenos Ayres, 1836) (book vi, p. 108) ;
45: P. del Techo: *Historia del Paraguay* .
45: Charlevoix
Chapter I of *A Vanishing Arcadia* ends at page 49. RBCG's *A Vanished Arcadia* may have 300+ footnotes and references.

JUSTICE AND SLAVERY :
Antonio de Montesinos O.P. (Dominican)(c. 1475-1540): "¿Estos no son hombres? ¿Con éstos no se deben guardar y cumplir los preceptos de caridad y de la justicia? ¿Estos no tenían sus tierras propias y sus señores y señoríos? ¿Estos hannos ofendido en algo? ¿La ley de Cristo no somos obligados a predicársela y trabajar con toda diligencia de convertirlos?... Todos estáis en pecado mortal, y en él vivís y morís, por la crueldad y tiranía que usáis con estas inocentes gentes." Sermón de Fray Antonio, Santo Domingo, diciembre de 1511.
Las Leyes de Burgos 1512: el requerimiento + la encomienda. See "Leyes de Burgos " in Spanish Wikipedia and "Laws of Burgos" in English Wikipedia. Latter lists the 35 laws – Law 25: "The Indians are not to be used in private trade or for any other economic interest" - and the 1513 amendments.

Francisco de Vitoria O.P. (1483/1486-1546): Wikipedia English – 5 pages, Spanish – 8 pages.
Bartolomé de las Casas O.P. (1474/1484 – 1566): Wikipedia English 24 pages, Spanish 21 pages. A Dominican friar from 1523.
Las Leyes Nuevas de 1542 See Internet: Leyes Nuevas ; Leyes Nuevas de Indias de 1542 ; Leyes Nuevas (1542) ; etc.
"Obedezco pero no cumplo"
Note tradition of medieval inter-faith religious-philosophical disputations, e.g. The Disputation of Barcelona 1263 between Pablo Christiani and Rabbi Moses ben Nachman, before King James I of Aragon. Dramatised in Hyam Maccoby's The Disputation, a TV play on Channel 4 (1986) starring Christopher Lee, Bob Peck and Alan Dobie. Also book by Hyam Maccoby: The Disputation (Calder Publications)
The Great Debate, Valladolid 1550-1551: Las Casas versus Ginés de Sepúlveda. See: Internet – The Las Casas-Sepúlveda Controversy 1550-1551. Plus: Wikipedia: Junta de Valladolid (10 pages, in Spanish). Plus French telefilm *La controverse de Valladolid* (1992, director Jean-Daniel Verhaeghe, script by Jean-Claude Carrière, actors Jean-Louis Trintignant (Sepúlveda), Jean-Pierre Marielle (Las Casas) et Jean Carmet (Papal Legate) – Excerpt lasting 13m41s at Youtube "Bartolomé de Las Casas et La Controverse de Valladolid"
Bartolomé de Las Casas: *Brevíssima relación de la destruición de las Indias* (Sevilla, 1552) . Edición de André Saint-Lu. (Cátedra Letras Hispánicas, Madrid, 1996. Décima edición).
Lewis Hanke: *The Spanish Struggle for Justice in the Conquest of America* (The American Historical Association, The University of Pennsylvania Press, First printing 1949, second printing 1959). Introduction ; Part I The first cry for justice in America: The sermons of Friar Antonio de Montesinos [1511]; The basis of Spain's right to rule the Indies ; The Requirement – A most remarkable document ; Part II Introduction ; Could the Indians learn to live like Christian Spaniards? ; Could the New World be colonized peacefully with farmers? ; Could the Faith be preached by peaceful means alone? ; Could the *encomienda* system be abolished? Part III The development of the struggle for justice 1550-1600: Introduction "All the peoples of the world are men" ; The waging of just war in the Indies ; The just titles of Spain to the Indies ; Just title discussions in Mexico and the Philippines ; Francisco de Toledo and the just titles to the Inca empire; Conclusion.

GEOGRAPHY: Independent countries emerged in the 19th century. Colonial Paraguay stretched from the River Plate in the south, included parts of today's northern Argentina, parts of todays's Bolivia in the far north and today's Brazil in the north-east. The dry arid Chaco in the west was inhabited by fierce tribes. Eastern Paraguay was sub-tropical, including what is now Misiones – repeat: Misiones - province in Argentina. Distances are still pretty frightening. The first foundation of "Buenos Ayres" (1536-1541) was abandoned because of persistent attacks by Querandí (Pampa) Indians, and the garrison moved 1,000 miles upriver to found a new settlement at Asunción in 1537. Rivers are vital: La Plata (they hoped to find silver mines there); the Paraguay in the west; the fast-flowing Paraná (just over 3,000 miles long from north to south. The Pilcomayo river in the west splits the Chaco region between Argentina and Paraguay. Access to the South Atlantic is via the river system down to the Plata estuary. Estimated population of Paraguay – 7.1 million, with 2.7 million in the capital's metropolitan area – mainly mestizo (mixed). The two official languages are Spanish and Guaraní, the latter understood by 90% of the population. Pure-blood indigenous (including Guaraní) element in the population may be around 1.7%. The Iguazú Falls are on the border between Misiones Province (Argentina) and

Brazil, though Paraguay has a town close by on the west side of the Paraná river at Ciudad del Este.

EXPLOITATION OF AND IN SPANISH AMERICA BY "EXTRACTIVE CAPITALISM":
Legend of **El (Príncipe) Dorado** (> Eldorado); legend of the Seven Cities of Cibola. Stories of fabulous quantities of gold and silver in Mexico and Perú. "Get-rich-quick" mentality, to be able then to return to Spain as an *indiano*, buy a big house and a landed estate and retire. After first generation looted all the gold and silver, settlers in Spanish America came to rely more on grants of land that formed large estates known as *haciendas* or *estancias* or *encomiendas***.** Grant of land included the native Americans who lived on that land and by the terms of *la encomienda* were obliged to contribute their (free?) labour to the landowner (*encomendero*, *hacendado*, *estanciero*) in exchange for Christianisation and basic protections.
Gold (Mexico, Perú) ; silver (Mexico) ; tomatoes, avocados, chillies (Mexico) ; potatoes (Perú, Bolivia) ; brazilwood (Brazil) ; sugar (Caribbean, Brazil) ; rubber (Brazil) ; coffee (Brazil) ; mahogany (Mexico, novels of Bruno Traven) ; tobacco (Caribbean, Brazil) ; quinine (Amazon) ; emeralds (Colombia) ; corned beef (Argentina/Uruguay, to Europa and USA post 1871, 'Fray Bentos') ; guano (seabird droppings for fertiliser, 'Nitrato de Chile') ; oil (Venezuela, Mexico) ; copper (Chile) ; tin (Bolivia) ; rum (Caribbean) ; tequila (Mexico) ; bananas (United Fruit Company, Caribbean, Colombia, Ecuador) ; anchovies (Perú) ; natural gas (Mexico) ; soya beans ; beef for hamburgers (Brazilian Amazon) ; wine (Argentina, Chile) ; flowers (Colombia) ; cocaine (Perú, Colombia).
Were the Jesuit Missions in Paraguay part of an "extractive capitalism"?

SPANISH-AMERICAN COLONIAL SOCIETY (see "Casta", 18 pages, in English Wikipedia) : Possibly six social classes: I – **Los peninsulares** – White people born in Spain of impeccable rac)ial and religious lineage ("la limpieza de sangre"), sent out usually as senior administrators (civil and religious) who would expect to serve a number of years in America and in time retire back to Spain. II – **Los criollos** – White people born in America of untainted racial or religious lineage who came to resent both the people appointed by and from Spain and the dictates of the Spanish Crown. At Independence (1806-1825) the criollos took over the new states from the peninsulares. III – **Los mestizos** – These, in the early days, were people born of a Spanish father and an American (Indian) mother or of a Spanish father and a Negro mother. By 1600 the mixes and combinations were varied and numerous. IV – **The mulattoes**, of Spanish and African descent. V – Those of **pure Native American descent** – los indios. In spite of official diktats from the Crown in Madrid, they were – because of *encomienda*- style arrangements - virtually medieval serfs. VI – **Slaves** (though slavery in the Spanish Empire was officially forbidden), usually of African origin.

THE FILM "THE MISSION" (1986) : Some commentaries: 1. "The Mission" (1986 film)" in English Wikipedia, 7 pages; 2. Internet "Movie Review: A Dilemma of Conscience at Heart of 'The Mission', by Sheila Benson, Nov. 14, 1986. 3 pages; 3. Internet "The Mission" (1986) by SDG, with site then given as www.decentfilms.com/reviews/mission. 8 pages. 4. Internet "Teach with Movies – The Mission". 12 pages. 5. Internet "The Mission" by Wesley Khristopher Teixeira Alves, with site given as www.people.bu.edu > thth > thth_projects_2007_wesley_alves.

Also: **THE CUNNINGHAME GRAHAM SOCIETY**
THE MERITS AND POSSIBLE DEMERITS OF THE FILM *THE MISSION* **(1986)**

Open debate – room 420, Livingstone Tower, Richmond Street, University of Strathclyde, Glasgow . Friday 24 July 2015, from 6 p.m. till 9 p.m.
Donation of £5 per head to cover cost of room hire.

The following is a series of quotes from "*The Mission* and Historical Missions – Film and the Writing of History" by James Schofield Saeger, chapter five of *Based on a True Story: Latin American History at the Movies*, edited by Donald F. Stevens (Scholarly Resources Inc., Wilmington DE, 1997; Third printing 2001, pages 63-84). The selection is by John C. McIntyre, dated 12.07.2015.

Quote 01: The Mission … displays paternalistic attitudes … The film's voice is a white European distortion of Native American reality. (page 63)
Quote 02: Bolt and Joffé in fact scorn accuracy and twist the truth… (page 64)
Quote 03: Native Americans appear throughout, but no Indian viewpoint emerges … (page 64)
Quote 04: … insulting stereotypes of colonized peoples. (page 64)
05: Reflecting in 1758 on the late Guarani war, the movie Altamirano says, "The Indians are once more free to be enslaved by the Spanish and Portuguese settlers," a misleading assertion initiating the ideological confusion to follow. (64)
06: … several nearly naked, painted Native American males (played by Onanís of Colombia) (65)
07: … one inaccurately concludes that customarily killing whites was their nature. This initial "Indian problem" forecasts the ethnic and ethical confusion of Bolt and Joffé. (65)
08: The early amicable Spanish-Guarani relationship, based on reciprocity and linked by marriage and kinship, soon became exploitative. Guaranis realized that their presumed alliance of equals had become burdensome, and they unsuccessfully rebelled in 1539 and 1542… (65)
09: A Paraguayan historian says, "Franciscan reductions were open, flexible and adapted to reality, as distinct from those of the Jesuits, where everything was ordered and pre-established". Many Franciscan missions survive today as Paraguayan communities, but few Jesuit-founded establishments do.(66)
10: Allowed the use of firearms, Guaranis quickly learned European military tactics from Jesuits. Organized into as many as eight militia companies per mission, Guaranis repelled the less disciplined forces of slavers from Sao Paulo. (66-67)
11: The bizarre suggestion that Guaranis accepted missions for European music echoes Caraman. Although the screen people are seemingly hunters and fishermen, aboriginal Guaranis were horticulturalists who supplemented garden plots with hunting… Guaranis welcomed missions for the steady supply of iron implements supplied by Jesuits… (67)
12: Denouncing the labor practices of lay Paraguayans, the script recreates the language of colonial Jesuits, not disinterested observers but advocates. When describing encomienda, they aimed to persuade the crown to exempt "their" Guaranis from labor obligations to other Spanish employers. (68).
13: There were few Jesuits martyred by Guaranis in the 1700s, although many were earlier… From the Native American point of view, however, the "martyr" label is a pernicious European construct. Guaranis thought that they executed Jesuit transgressors for just cause. (68)
14: Joffé thus ignores Jesuit and Guarani economic motives for resistance and presents the moral issue as Jesuit/good and Spaniard/bad. As compensation for the transfer, the crown promised each mission 4,000 pesos, or about one peso each for the 29,191 Guaranis of the seven missions. The lands, livestock, and buildings of these seven missions, however, were actually worth from 7 to 16 million pesos, and Guaranis and Jesuits felt cheated. (68

15: Guarani witnesses to this act [Mendoza released from his burden] rejoice with words so trivial that Joffé thinks them unworthy of English translation. Movie Guaranis have such limited reason that gestures and Jesuits adequately render their thoughts. The film-makers assume Jesuit policies identical with Guarani interests, untrue historically and unconvincing on film. (69)
16: *The Mission*, therefore, … is about priests, imperial administrators and settlers (69)
17: … naked screen women alter history for prurient effect (69)
18: Guaranis who kill little pigs are brutal primitives. (69)
19: Film Jesuits imagine that Guaranis who joined missions immediately accepted Christianity, a historically inaccurate supposition. Most Guaranis rejected Christianity for decades, often generations … Nevertheless, technical adviser Caraman thinks that, "From the forests, Indians came into the settlements drawn by the magnificence of divine worship and slowly penetrated the veil of drama to the truths of the Christian faith." This assertion is wishful thinking, little related to the reality that Jesuit missionaries knew. (70)
20: *The Mission* trades historical authenticity for a movie paradise … the lush score of Ennio Morricone romanticizes primitive life … Suppressing the conflict that punctuated life in all missions, additional scenes show a paradise of interracial harmony, peace, mutual contentment, and the thriving economy of San Carlos… (70)
21: Joffé here [the debate] resurrects for the 1750s issues of Indian personhood that historical Spanish monarchs and theologians settled in the 1500s, a chronological rearrangement that blames Spanish lawmakers for the sin of neglecting Indian rights, of which they are innocent. [1503, 1512, 1542-43, and in Paraguay the Ordinances of Alfaro of 1612] … Laws in missions were the laws of Spain, and Jesuits and Guaranis usually obeyed them. If these laws were too often ignored by others, their existence still shows a care for Indian well-being. Denying this concern confirms movie anti-Hispanicism. (70-71)
22: … he [Father Gabriel] gives no example of Guarani spirituality… He does, though, offer a gratuitous and culturally relativistic explanation of Indian infanticide … Because they were an agrarian people, they mostly rejected infanticide… Defending a tradition foreign to Guaranis, Joffé denies their identity. (71)
23: Historical Jesuits mixed coercion, persuasion, and material rewards to bring Guaranis to missions with the discipline that kept them there, and Guaranis in missions were unfree. Jesuits subjected them to a centralizing disciplineand to economic conformity. … the civil province of Paraguay, where the government allowed them to sell their labor services on the open market, a right forbidden by Jesuits. Moreover, in Jesuit missions, beatings were not unknown. (71-72)
24: Did mission Guaranis dispose of their harvests and herds as they wished?... In fact, historical Jesuits supervised mission harvests, surpluses, and access to the market, and Guaranis yearned for more participation … (73)
25: … historical achievements, which were in fact considerable… Jesuit prosperity [yerba mate]… The missions also kept great herds of livestock for domestic consumption and sale. In 1768 the Guarani missions of the departed Jesuits had almost 700,000 cattle, over 240,000 sheep, 73,850 mares and horses, 15,235 mules, and 8,063 asses… In the film, Altamirano marvels at Guarani educational success, a bounteous mission orchard, and Indian singing. Guaranis making violins fascinate him…
26: … the movie's historical and Indian problems are revealed by the appearance of a Guarani priest at San Miguel, because there were no Indian Jesuits in Paraguay. (73-74)
27: These Guaranis have no myths, legends, or religious beliefs. They have no shamans. No leader challenges Jesuit authority, as did Tapé shamans Yaguarobí and Yeguacaporú in 1635 as

they resisted Jesuit efforts to bring their people to missions. Movie Guaranis are cultural ciphers. (74)
28: Guaranis finally resist. Joffé, however, conceals Indian decision making, recording only a missionary'sparaphrase.(74)
29: Through Father Gabriel, a movie cacique asks why God had them build a mission and changed his mind. This question lacks verisimilitude because Guarani deities reversed themselves whimsically, and such a turn would have seemed normal. (74)
30: As Spaniards force Guaranis from missions, the film's anti-Hispanicism intensifies… (75)
31: In San Carlos, Guaranis choose between Jesuit paths of resistance, the nonviolence of Father Gabriel and the armed rebellion of Fathers Ralph, John, and Mendoza… (75)
32: … an effective militia protected reductions beginning in the 1640s. To recognize the missions' military potential and the Guaranis' century-long mastery of firearms, though, did not suit Joffé's purpose… The priest-led Indian resistance of the film was an all-Guarani affair historically … Why create a Jesuit-led resistance when Jesuits insisted credibly that they had no part of treason? Movie Indians need Jesuit help. Joffé's Guaranis are incapable of independent resistance. In historical fact, though, "this was a genuine and spontaneous revolt by the Guarani…" (76-77)
Uniformed government killers in the film butcher surrendering Guaranis – as historical allied armies massacred them, though not Jesuits, at the battle of Caaibaté [1756], which broke Guarani resistance… European troops murder Father Gabriel and a procession of unarmed worshippers. This scene is another black-legend characterization because sending Indians to forced labour would be more rational and profitable. In the final scenes, Altamirano condemns the excessive slaughter, but the Paraguayan governor defends the killings. As a counterpoint, beautiful young Guarani survivors retrieve a cross from the river. Still preferring European culture to their own, they paddle off treasuring a violin. (77-78)
34: This confused yet beautifully filmed and scored movie… the movie's spiteful anti-Hispanicism … because these able warriors rebelled against encomenderos in the 1500s and against Jesuits in the 1600s… aboriginal traditions persisted in the historical missions, as seen in the continuing desire of caciques for plural marriages in 1735. (78)
35: *The Mission*'s contempt for Native Americans grows from a Jesuit-centred point of view gone awry, echoing the academic founders of mission history… In Bolton's history, Indians were on the peripheries because Bolton and his contemporaries were Eurocentric… Relegating "barbarian" peoples to an inferior position, he emphasized the "civilizing function of the typical Spanish mission"…. (78)
36: Although *The Mission* strives to be politically progressive, it is compromised by its racism. One regrets that Father Daniel Berrigan, supporting actor and technical adviser to the film, cares little about accuracy. Although he and Joffé oppose injustice and endorse humanitarian policies towards the oppressed, the film's demeaning of Guarani culture weakens their case. (79)
37: The history of Guarani missions should be reinterpreted by placing the missionized at the center of the investigation. (79)
38: [Final paragraph of the Saeger article] The challenge facing the next historians of Guarani-Jesuit missions, therefore, parallels that faced by the team that made *The Mission*: to create a Guarani humanity. These artists needed no documents. They had only to understand that Guaranis were culturally whole. Instead, they created Indians without culture. They did not imagine that Guaranis had inner lives apart from the Jesuits, as any group would. Future historians must correct their errors. (page 83)